



# LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

Teri Rennia, City Council President  
Angela Holmes, City Clerk

---

**MINUTES**  
**City Council Finance Committee**  
**Budget Hearing**  
**City Council Work Room, 38 Hawley Street, Binghamton, N.Y.**  
**Monday September 23, 2013**

**Called to Order.** Called to order at 5:00pm by Councilwoman Webb, City Council Finance Chair.

**Council Members Present:** Joseph Mihalko, Teri Rennia, Lea Webb (Chair), Bill Berg

**Council Members Absent:** Jerry Motsavage (Committee Member, arrived at 5:04pm), Chris Papastrat (arrived at 5:25pm), John Matzo (Committee Member, arrived at 5:25pm)

**Also in attendance:** Bill Barber, Director of Parks & Recreation; Kenneth J. Frank, Corporation Counsel; Angela Holmes, City Clerk; Gerald Kennicutt, Deputy Comptroller; Charles Pearsall, Comptroller; Paul Palmer, Park Maintenance Supervisor; Kyle Seeley, Executive Assistant to the Mayor

## ITEMS CONSIDERED

**Budget Items: Parks & Recreation, Parks, Playground & Recreation Centers; Beaches & Pools, Youth Programs, Adult Recreation, Senior Center, Capital Improvements**

Presented by: Bill Barber, Director of Parks & Recreation; Paul Palmer, Park Maintenance Supervisor

Call pages 78-85.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Mihalko.

Councilman Motsavage noted for the record that he would abstain from voting upon any item relating to the Ely Park Golf Course, as he is employed by the managing company of said golf course.

Motion to reduce budget line A7020.54610 (Building/Equip Repairs & Maint) from \$10,000 to \$7,500, moving \$2,500 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency), with the intent that such funds shall remain in Contingency should the Department of Parks & Recreation require additional funds for building and equipment repair and maintenance.

Moved by Berg, seconded by Papastrat.

**Motion carried. (Vote 6-0-1)**

Ayes: Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Abstain: Motsavage

Motion to reduce budget line A7020.52200 (Furniture) from \$3,500 to \$2,000, moving \$1,500 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Mihalko, seconded by Rennia.

**Motion carried. (Vote 6-1)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo

Nays: Berg



## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

Motion to reduce budget line A7020.54701 (Travel & Training) from \$6,400 to \$4,900, moving \$1,500 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Mihalko.

**Motion and second withdrawn.**

Motion to hold pages 78-79.

Moved by Motsavage, seconded by Berg.

**Items held.**

Motion to reduce budget line A7110.51000 (Personal Services), transferring \$39,354 from the position of "Tree Trimmer/Arborist @ \$21.60, 1 @ 44,928" to the position of "Tree Trimmer @ \$18.92, 0 @ 39,354", along with associated benefits to refund that position, and transferring the remaining amount from the position of "Tree Trimmer/Arborist @ \$21.60, 1 @ 44,928" to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Motsavage, seconded by Papastrat.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

**Executive Session.** Motion to enter into Executive Session at 6:15pm to discuss personnel and litigation.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Papastrat.

**Voice vote, none opposed.**

**Reconvene.** Called to order at 6:15pm by Councilwoman Webb, City Council Finance Chair.

**Council Members Present:** Jerry Motsavage (Committee Member), Joseph Mihalko, Teri Rennia, Lea Webb (Chair), Chris Papastrat, John Matzo (Committee Member), Bill Berg

**Council Members Absent:** None

**Also in attendance:** Bill Barber, Director of Parks & Recreation; Luke Day, Commissioner of Public Works; Kenneth J. Frank, Corporation Counsel; Angela Holmes, City Clerk; Gerald Kennicutt, Deputy Comptroller; Philip T. Krey, City Engineer; Charles Pearsall, Comptroller; Paul Palmer, Park Maintenance Supervisor; Kyle Seeley, Executive Assistant to the Mayor

Motion to reduce budget line A7110.54640 (Parks Repairs & Maint) from \$19,500 to \$18,000, moving \$1,500 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Motsavage, seconded by Rennia.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to reduce budget line A7110.54202 (Electricity) from \$70,000 to \$65,000, moving \$5,000 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**



## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Motion to hold pages 80-82.  
Moved by Mihalko, seconded by Rennia.

Motion to reduce budget line A7140.51800 (Temporary Services) from \$189,500 to \$180,000, transferring \$9,500 to A1990.51000 (Contingency).  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Motion to hold page 83.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Mihalko.  
**Item held.**

Motion to move page 84.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Mihalko.  
**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Motion to move page 85.  
Moved by Papastrat, seconded by Matzo.  
**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Call pages 89-91.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.

Motion to move page 89.  
Moved by Berg, seconded by Matzo.  
**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**  
Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Motion to move pages 90-91.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.  
**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**  
Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Call pages 189 and 191.



## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

Moved by Webb, seconded by Rennia.

Motion to hold pages 189 & 191.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Mihalko.

**Items held.**

**Recess.** Motion to recess at 7:39pm for ten minutes.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded Matzo.

**Voice vote, none opposed.**

**Reconvene.** Called to order at 7:55pm by Councilwoman Webb, City Council Finance Chair.

**Council Members Present:** Jerry Motsavage (Committee Member), Joseph Mihalko, Teri Rennia, Lea Webb (Chair), Chris Papastrat, John Matzo (Committee Member), Bill Berg

**Council Members Absent:** None

**Also in attendance:** Luke Day, Commissioner of Public Works; Kenneth J. Frank, Corporation Counsel; Angela Holmes, City Clerk; Gerald Kennicutt, Deputy Comptroller; Philip T. Krey, City Engineer; Charles Pearsall, Comptroller; Kyle Seeley, Executive Assistant to the Mayor

**Budget Items: Engineering, Capital Improvements**

Presented by: Philip T. Krey, City Engineer

Call pages 29-30.  
Moved by Webb, seconded by Rennia.

Motion to move pages 29-30.  
Moved by Berg, seconded by Rennia.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Call page 191.  
Moved by Berg, seconded by Mihalko.

Motion to hold page 191.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.

**Item held.**

Motion to recall page 191.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Mihalko.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None



## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

Motion to approve all Engineering capital improvement lines.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to hold page 191.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.

**Item held.**

**Budget Items: Public Works Administration, City Hall Operation of Plant, Central Garage, Signals/Combined Shops, Maintenance of Roads, Snow Removal, Street Lighting, Sanitation, Refuse Summary, Refuse Unallocated Insurance, Refuse Personnel, Refuse State Retirement, Refuse Social Security, Refuse Workers Compensation, Refuse Unemployment Insurance, Refuse Disability Insurance, Refuse Health Insurance, Refuse Other Employee Benefits, Capital Improvements**

Presented by: Luke Day, Commissioner of Public Works

Call pages 32-39.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

Motion to reduce budget line A1490.51000 (Personal Services), transferring \$52,500 plus associated benefits from the position of "Superintendent of City Streets, 1 @ \$60,000" to the position of "2<sup>nd</sup> Deputy DPW Commissioner, 0 @ \$52,500", and transferring all remaining funds from the position of "Superintendent of City Streets, 1 @ \$60,000" to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency), leaving the position vacant and funded at \$0.

Moved by Papastrat, seconded by Matzo.

**Motion failed. (Vote 3-4)**

Ayes: Mihalko, Papastrat, Matzo

Nays: Motsavage, Rennia, Webb, Berg

Motion to reduce budget line A1490.51000 (Personal Services), reducing the salary of "Superintendent of City Streets, 1 @ \$60,000" to \$55,000, and transferring \$5,000 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Berg, seconded by Rennia.

**Motion withdrawn.**

Motion to reduce budget line A1490.51000 (Personal Services), reducing the salary of "Superintendent of City Streets, 1 @ \$60,000" to \$52,520, and transferring \$7,480 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Berg, seconded by Matzo.

**Motion carried. (Vote 4-3)**

Ayes: Mihalko, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: Motsavage, Rennia, Webb

Motion to reduce budget line A1490.51800 (Temporary Services) from \$7,000 to \$3,500, moving \$3,500 to budget line A1990.55000 (Contingency).

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Mihalko.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**



## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to hold pages 32-33.

Moved by Papastrat, seconded by Berg.

**Items held.**

Motion to move pages 34-35.

Moved by Berg, seconded by Rennia.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to reduce budget line A1640.54110 (Vehicle Parts) from \$190,000 to \$160,000, moving \$30,000 to budget line A1990.55003 (DPW Contingency), and to request that the Mayor's Office initiate the establishment of a Vehicle Parts line in the 2014 Parks & Recreation budget with the intent that such funds will be transferred thereto.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move pages 36-37.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move pages 38-39.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Call pages 70-74.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

Motion to move pages 70-71.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move page 72.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**



## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Move pages 73-74.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Call pages 94-95.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

Motion to move pages 94-95.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Call pages 173-183.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.

Motion to move page 174.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Motion to move page 175.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Motion to move page 176.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None

Motion to move page 177.  
Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg  
Nays: None



## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

Motion to move 178.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move page 179.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move page 180.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move page 181.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move page 182.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Motion to move page 183.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Motion carried. (Vote 7-0)**

Ayes: Motsavage, Mihalko, Rennia, Webb, Papastrat, Matzo, Berg

Nays: None

Call pages 189 and 191.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Berg.

Motion to hold pages 189 and 191.

Moved by Rennia, seconded by Motsavage.

**Items held.**

**Adjournment.** Motion to adjourn at 11:30pm.

Moved by Matzo, seconded by Papastrat.





## LEGISLATIVE BRANCH ▪ CITY OF BINGHAMTON

*Teri Rennia, City Council President*  
*Angela Holmes, City Clerk*

---

**Voice vote, none opposed.**